Comparing collective bargaining agreements for developing countries

Janna Besamusca & Kea Tijdens

ILO RDW conference
Geneva, 9 July 2015
The value of collective bargaining agreements

• CBAs can be an important wage setting instrument (Freeman & Medoff, 1984)

• Has been linked to positive social outcomes, such as decent wages and lower inequality (Magda et al, 2012; Blien et al, 2013)

• As well as to a broader decent work agenda, such as work-life arrangements (Yerkes & Tijdens, 2010), working hours (Dunn & Wright, 1994), training (Hayter et al), etc.
Research gaps

Yet,

• Varying collective bargaining coverage and centralisation of wage setting
• Little insight into the extent CBAs set actual wage *levels* and working conditions outside Australia, Austria, Germany, the Netherlands, Switzerland, South Africa and Brazil

Limited empirical evidence that CBAs contain exact clauses on levels of wages, wage structures, social security, leaves and working hours
Research objectives


• We selected 249 collective agreements from the eleven countries with at least ten agreements. Two Latin American countries (Brazil and Peru), four English speaking African countries (Ghana, Kenya, Uganda and Tanzania), four French speaking African countries (Benin, Madagascar, Senegal and Togo) and one South East Asian country (Indonesia).

• We research to what extent wage and other remuneration-related clauses, working hours, paid leave arrangements and work-family arrangements are included in collective agreements and whether bargaining topics cluster within agreements.
The Collective Bargaining Agreements (CBA) Database aims to publish full text and coded information about Collective Agreements on the national WageIndicator web pages.

By May 2015, 440 agreements from 25 countries had been entered and were published on the national websites.

The Collective Bargaining Agreement Database is free to use. The online tool contains the full collective agreements’ texts, which can be found by name or characteristics of the agreements.
The data collection and coding process

- Social partners collect CBAs and the WageIndicator team codes them.
- The database’s coding scheme consists of two parts with in total almost 300 variables. The first part covers meta-level data about the collective agreement.
- The second part relates to the agreement’s content, coded according to eight topics, namely
  1) wages, 2) working hours, schedules, paid leaves and paid holidays, 3) employment contracts, 4) work-family arrangements, 5) arrangements concerning health and medical assistance, 6) sickness and disability arrangements, 7) social security and pensions, and 8) training.
Looking up CBAs online

Collective Agreements in Kenya

Almost all Kenyan collective agreements are published here soon. You can find the original texts, read them and navigate through single chapters and articles, according to the topics you are interested in. On the left there is the full text, while in the right column you will find a summary of the collective agreement.

Trade unions (CCTU) and employers (FKE) from Kenya contributed to the collection of these CBAs.

Publication is developed by WageIndicator Foundation and University of Dar es Salaam. Contact us.

- All about Collective Bargaining in Kenya
- Compare the articles of the Collective Agreements from Kenya with other countries

Collective Agreements Full Text

- Memorandum of agreement - Afro Plastics Kenya Ltd
- Collective Bargaining Agreement Between Alpha Fine Foods Limited and Kenya Union Of Commercial Food And Allied Workers
- Collective Bargaining Agreement Between General Motors East Africa Ltd And Amalgamated Union Of Kenya Metal Workers
Comparing CBAs online

Compare Collective Agreements

How to start?
Select an issue. You get the best results when you type in a key word, like [Maternity Leave], or [Pay rise].
Select one or more countries. Select one or more industries. Click on 'Search' and check the results below. The tool is only available in the text will always come in the language of the collective agreement.
Give us feedback when you are happy or unhappy with the results. WageIndicator Collective Agreement Database team

Issues
Don't select anything for no filtering

Does the agreement have clauses on paid maternity leave?

Countries
Kenya

Industries
31 selected

Search Reset
Which clauses are included?

• We find that 98% of the collective agreements include clauses on wages, but that only few agreements specify wage levels. Up to 71% have clauses on social security, 89% on working hours and 84% on work-family arrangements.

• Relatively large variation within countries in terms of working hours and paid annual leave days. Core issues on the table during the negotiations of a collective bargaining agreement,

• Clauses on work-family arrangements are relatively common. They are more common than social security clauses and occur only slightly less frequently than working hour clauses.
Agreed clauses

- Child care clause
- Paid maternity leave clause
- Clauses on work-family arrangements
- Paid leave clause
- Standard working hours clause
- Health/medical assistance clause
- Sickness and disability clauses
- Employer contributions to unemployment fund
- Employer contributions to disability fund
- Employer contributions to pension fund
- Wages tied to skills
- Pay scales
- Lowest wage clause
Which levels are agreed in CBAs

- CBAs do set working conditions: large variation in clauses and contents of the agreements. CBAs are more than a mere reiteration of national legislation.
- CBA clauses are moderately and positively correlated with the legal standard. We interpret this as a non-trivial commitment to uphold the law.
Equal to, better or worse than the law?

- Working Hours
  - Below legal standard: 5%
  - Equal to legal standard: 40%
  - Above legal standard: 55%

- Annual leave
  - Below legal standard: 6%
  - Equal to legal standard: 48%
  - Above legal standard: 46%

- Maternity leave
  - Below legal standard: 8%
  - Equal to legal standard: 60%
  - Above legal standard: 32%
Is there a pay off?

• Agenda setting trade off: collective agreements including one of these four clauses, are also more likely to include the other three. No trade off between their inclusion on the bargaining agenda.

• Content trade off: some evidence of a trade-off. Shorter working weeks are associated with longer leaves, but a longer leave period of one kind is also associated with a shorter leave of the other.
Further research

More and more detailed analyses are possible, especially as the dataset grows. In particular, we suggest more research into:

- The content trade off
- Annual working hours and pay scales
- Coverage rates and bargaining regimes

• Contact

  Janna Besamusca J.Besamusca@uva.nl
  Kea Tijdens K.G.Tijdens@uva.nl
### Agenda setting trade off

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td></td>
<td>Social Security clause</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Social Security clause</strong></td>
<td>5.116 (.643)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Working hours clause</strong></td>
<td>5.171 (.643)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Work-family clause</strong></td>
<td>9.597 (.559)***</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Public Sector</strong></td>
<td>0.538 (.644)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Manufacturing</strong></td>
<td>1.002 (.398)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Constant</strong></td>
<td>.067</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>-2 Log Likelihood</strong></td>
<td>204.751</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>n</strong></td>
<td>196</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Content trade off

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Dependent Variable</th>
<th>Weekly working hours</th>
<th>Paid annual leave (days)</th>
<th>Paid maternity leave (weeks)</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Weekly working hours</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.745 (.075)***</td>
<td>-0.080 (.035) *</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid annual leave (days)</td>
<td>-0.666 (.067)***</td>
<td></td>
<td>-0.086 (.033)*</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Paid maternity leave (weeks)</td>
<td>-0.630 (.271)*</td>
<td>-0.751 (.285)*</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Public Sector</td>
<td>5.125 (1.648)**</td>
<td>4.296 (1.774)*</td>
<td>0.009 (.616)</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Manufacturing</td>
<td>0.355 (.613)</td>
<td>-0.493 (.645)</td>
<td>-0.622 (.210) **</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Constant</td>
<td>-1.229</td>
<td>1.368</td>
<td>0.170</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Adj. R square</td>
<td>0.510</td>
<td>0.496</td>
<td>0.113</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>n</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>105</td>
<td>105</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>